

Anthony W. Rosa Chief of Police

10440 West Oakland Park Blvd. Sunrise, Florida 33351 (954) 746-3600



# Internal Affairs Investigation

Subject Officers:

Officer Roshanda McWilliams
Officer Natesha Smith
IA Case No. 21-08-02
Incident Date: July 23, 2021

<u>Complainant</u> Djavan Alexander

Internal Affairs Investigator Lt. P. Brian Katz



Anthony Rosa Chief of Police

10440 West Oakland Park Blvd. Sunrise, Florida 33351 (954) 764-4357



## TABLE OF CONTENTS

**IA CASE NO. 21-08-02** 

- 1. Preliminary Complaint Report (PCR) with written narrative authored by Lt. William Bates / Employee Complaint Brochure.
- 2. Internal Affairs Complaint Report Narrative:
  - > Introduction
  - > Investigative Narrative
  - > Investigative Findings & Disposition
- 3. Affidavit of Compliance Internal Affairs Investigator.
- 4. CAD Report for Case # 42-2107-029792 Traffic Stop.
- 5. Uniform Traffic Citation # AEQGGKE & Report.
- 6. Notice of Compliance for Djavan Alexander (Complainant)
- 7. Photographs.
- 8. Sunrise Police Department Policies and Procedures Chapter # 15
  - Unbiased Policing
- 9. Sunrise Police Department Policies and Procedures Chapter # 56
  - Traffic Enforcement Guidelines
- 10. BWC Videos
- 11. Sworn Statements:
  - > Christopher Pullease Sergeant at Sunrise PD.
  - > Jordan Pacheco Police Officer at Sunrise PD.
  - > Andrew Saavedra Police Officer at Sunrise PD.
  - > Roshanda McWilliams Police Officer at Sunrise PD.
  - > Natesha Smith Police Officer at Sunrise PD.



Anthony Rosa Chief of Police

10440 W Oakland Park Blvd Sunrise, Florida 33351 (954) 764-4357



### Internal Affairs Complaint Report Narrative

### I. INTRODUCTION:

Subject Employee: Officer Natesha Smith and Officer Roshanda McWilliams

Complainant: Djavan Alexander

Witnesses: Officer Jordan Pacheco, Officer Andrew Saavedra, Sergeant Christopher

Pullease.

On July 23, 2021, at approximately 2:14pm, Ofc. Smith conducted a traffic stop on a gray 2019 Nissan, bearing a FL tag of QIFN76 for making an improper U-turn at the 8100 block of Sunset Strip. Upon making contact with the driver and sole occupant of the vehicle (Mr. Djavan Alexander), Ofc. Smith explained the reason for the traffic stop. Mr. Alexander immediately became argumentative with Ofc. Smith and began to record the interaction with his cell phone. Ofc. Smith requested back-up Officers to respond and Officers McWilliams, Pacheco, and Saavedra all arrived on scene. Mr. Alexander was issued a Florida Uniform Traffic Citation for "U-turn / Improper / Unsafe / Prohibited", which is a violation of F.S.S. 316.1515. The entire incident lasted approximately 15 minutes and was captured on this listed Officers BWC.

On this same date, Mr. Alexander responded to the Sunrise Police Department with his mother and filed a formal complaint with Sgt. Pullease. In his complaint, Mr. Alexander alleged that he was profiled by Ofc. Smith and he did not make an illegal U-turn. Mr. Alexander also alleged that Ofc. McWilliams refused to identify herself.

On August 3, 2021, Chief Anthony W. Rosa authorized a formal investigation into this case.

The *Investigative Narrative* section outlines the details of my investigation into this matter and my conclusions with respect to any violations are found in the *Investigative Findings and Disposition* section.



Anthony W. Rosa
Chief of Police

10440 West Oakland Park Blvd. Sunrise, Florida 33351 (954) 746-3600



# Internal Affairs Investigation

**Subject Officers:** 

Officer Roshanda McWilliams
Officer Natesha Smith
IA Case No. 21-08-02
Incident Date: July 23, 2021

<u>Complainant</u> Djavan Alexander

Internal Affairs Investigator Lt. P. Brian Katz



Anthony Rosa Chief of Police

10440 W Oakland Park Blvd Sunrise, Florida 33351 (954) 764-4357



## Internal Affairs Complaint Report Narrative

### II. INVESTIGATIVE NARRATIVE:

On July 23, 2021, Sgt. Christopher Pullease completed a Preliminary Complaint Report and attached a hand-written complaint form filed by Djavan Alexander after speaking with him at the Sunrise Police Department. Mr. Alexander was accompanied by his mother, who was not a witness to this incident.

On August 3, 2021, Chief Anthony W. Rosa authorized a formal investigation into this incident and the actions of the involved Officers.

On September 10, 2021, I reviewed the C.A.D. report and all other relevant written documents related to this incident, to include the Florida Citation Report and Florida Uniform Traffic Citation #AEQGGKE.

On September 14, 2021, I reviewed all of the Body Worn Camera Video associated with this case. This includes both of the subject Officers, witness Officers, and the Supervisor (Sgt. Pullease) taking the compliant at the Sunrise Police Department. During Sergeant Pullease's BWC video, Mr. Alexander can be observed showing Sergeant Pullease his own cell phone video that he recorded during the traffic stop. This cell phone video is a mirror image of the Officers' BWC videos, with the exception that it is from Mr. Alexander's vantage point. Sergeant Pullease did not collect this video, however portions of it are able to be viewed in Sergeant Pullease's BWC. Sergeant Pullease was professional and courteous to Mr. Alexander and his mother, and he clearly explained the complaint process to them both. Sergeant Pullease also advised that if Mr. Alexander felt as if he did not make an illegal U-turn, for which he was cited for, he could simply elect to take the citation to traffic court. Sergeant Pullease further explained that filing a complaint against the Officers would not result in the citation being disposed of.

The actual traffic stop and the interactions between Mr. Alexander and the Officers are clearly captured on Officers' Smith, McWilliams, Pacheco, and Saavedra's BWC. Officer Smith conducts the traffic stop by herself on Mr. Alexander and upon making contact with him, she immediately stated the reason for the stop. Mr. Alexander immediately starts to argue with Ofc. Smith. He disputes the fact that he made an illegal U-turn. Officer Smith remains professional and requests Mr. Alexander's driver's license, registration and proof of automobile insurance, to which Mr. Alexander initially refuses and begins to video tape the encounter himself,

utilizing his cell phone. Officer Smith tells Mr. Alexander that the traffic stop is already being recorded via her own BWC. Once Mr. Alexander is recording Officer Smith with his cell phone, he asked Officer Smith for her name and badge number, which she provides. Mr. Alexander then produces his driver's license but none of the other requested documents required for the traffic stop. When Officer Smith again requests Mr. Alexander's vehicle registration and proof of automobile insurance, he reaches for the closed glove compartment on the passenger's side. Before he can open the glove compartment, Officer Smith verbally tells him to stop reaching and asked him if he had any weapons or drugs in the vehicle that she should know about, to which Mr. Alexander clearly takes offense to, and he refuses to answer the question, by stating to Officer Smith: "I don't answer questions". Officer Smith instructs Mr. Alexander, if he cannot answer that question then do not open to glove compartment. At this point, only a minute or so has gone by in the traffic stop, Officer Smith is alone and the interaction has become contentious. Officer Smith is heard requesting over her police radio an ETA for her back-up Officer.

Shortly thereafter, Mr. Alexander explains that his other documents are located in the glove compartment and Officer Smith then allows him to open it to get his documents. Mr. Alexander tells Officer Smith that he is going to "take his time" getting the documents because "it is hot outside" and "he is enjoying this". Officer Smith patiently waits outside of the driver's side window for Mr. Alexander to get his other documents, while also waiting for backup Officers to arrive. Mr. Alexander then looks directly at Officer Smith and states: "Hi pretty". "You're pretty in the face". Mr. Alexander is clearly being condescending to Officer Smith as she waits for her back-up Officers to arrive.

Once back-up Officers Saavedra and Pacheco arrive on scene, Officer Smith returns to her marked police vehicle and is observed completing a Uniform Traffic Citation. When Officer McWilliams arrives on scene, she immediately walks over to Officer Smith (who is inside her police vehicle) and is overheard asking Officer Smith: "This guy giving you problems"? When Officer McWilliams approaches the vehicle, she stands behind the drives side, as Officers Saavedra and Pacheco are already in contact with Mr. Alexander. Mr. Alexander immediately turns his head in Officer McWilliams' direction and asked her for her "name and badge number". From other Officer's BWC videos, Officer McWilliams is seen pointing to her name tag, which is clearly displayed in large white letters on her outer patrol vest. Mr. Alexander is heard repeating Officer McWilliams' name back to her. He asked Officer McWilliams for her "badge number" and before she can answer, he turns his head again and states to Officer Pacheco: "She's not going to give it to me" and begins to engage Officer Pacheco again in a conversation about a vehicle accident that he observed a few days ago.

Officer Smith returned to Mr. Alexander's vehicle and issues him a Uniform Traffic Citation for making an illegal U-Turn. Mr. Alexander called Officer Smith a "liar" and the traffic stop is then concluded.

On September 14, 2021, I left a voicemail message for Mr. Alexander to contact me on his listed telephone number. I did not receive a response back from Mr. Alexander.

On September 15, 2021, I obtained a sworn taped statement from Sergeant Chris Pullease regarding this incident. Sergeant Pullease advised that he made contact with Mr. Alexander and his

mother on the date of the traffic stop at the Sunrise Police Department. Sergeant Pullease stated that Mr. Alexander wished to file a formal complaint against Officers Smith and McWilliams for their unprofessional behavior. More Specifically, Mr. Alexander advised Sergeant Pullease that Officer Smith conducted an illegal traffic stop due to being profiled and Officer McWilliams failed to identify herself when requested to do so. Sergeant Pullease inquired as to if Mr. Alexander's mother was a witness to the traffic stop and she stated that she was not.

Sergeant Pullease stated that Mr. Alexander showed him a recorded video from his personal cell phone of the traffic stop and the interaction with the Officers. Sergeant Pullease did not obtain a copy of this cell phone video, however the entire incident is captured on the listed Officers' BWC.

Sergeant Pullease confirmed via the BWC that immediately upon making contact with Mr. Alexander, Officer Smith advised him of the reason for the traffic stop, to which Mr. Alexander becomes argumentative. When Mr. Alexander asks for Officer Smith's name and badge number, she provides it.

I asked Sergeant Pullease if he explained to Mr. Alexander, that if he didn't agree with the Officer's reason for the traffic stop, that he could simply take the citation to traffic court, to which Sergeant Pullease stated: "I provided him knowledge that there's three ways of how to take care of the citation. And his demeanor was that he – the way I perceived it, is if he came in and made a complaint on these Officers, that that would resolve the ticket. I told him that's not the case".

Sergeant Pullease advised that prior to giving this investigator a statement, he reviewed the Officers' BWC of this incident. Sergeant Pullease also verified that Officer McWilliams identified herself when requested, by pointing to her bold white name tag on her vest. Mr. Alexander can be seen and heard on the BWC stating the Officers name aloud: "R. McWilliams". Since Mr. Alexander alleged that he was profiled for this traffic stop, I inquired if Sergeant Pullease knew the race and sex of the involved Officers in this case, to which he advised:

- Officer Smith Black Female
- Officer McWilliams Black Female
- Officer Pacheco Hispanic Male
- Officer Saavedra White Male.

I concluded the interview with Sergeant Pullease by asking him if, after reviewing Mr. Alexander's self-produced cell phone video, all of the involved Officers' BWC, and all of the other documents related to this case, if he felt the Officers violated any of Sunrise Police Policies or Procedures, to which he stated: "No I don't". (See Sergeant Pullease's transcripts for further details).

On September 15, 2021, I sent a Notice of Compliance out via certified mail to Mr. Alexander which advised him that I needed to obtain a sworn statement from him regarding this incident. I did not receive a response back from Mr. Alexander.

On September 15, 2021, I obtained a sworn taped statement from Officer Pacheco regarding this incident. Officer Pacheco advised that he responded to the traffic stop due to Officer Smith requesting a back-up Officer over the police radio. Officer Pacheco stated that when he arrived, he

observed Officer Smith speaking with the driver (Mr. Alexander) and it appeared that Officer Smith had already collected his license, registration and insurance information. Officer Pacheco described Mr. Alexander as "agitated" and immediately asked for his "name and badge number", all while appearing to record this incident on his personal cellphone. Officer Pacheco advised that he gave Mr. Alexander the requested information and then stood by the driver's side window, while Officer Smith went back to her patrol vehicle to complete a traffic citation.

I asked Officer Pacheco if he could approximate how long the traffic stop took to complete, to which he stated: "From the time I got there, probably about ten or fifteen minutes". I asked Officer Pacheco if he witnessed Officer Smith or any of the other back-up Officers act unprofessionally to Mr. Alexander, to which he replied: "No". Officer Pacheco advised that Mr. Alexander was issued a traffic citation for making an improper U-turn and the traffic stop was then concluded. (See Officer Pacheco's transcripts for further details).

On September 16, 2021, I obtained a sworn taped statement from Officer Saavedra in reference to this incident. Officer Saavedra advised that he responded to Officer Smith's traffic stop as a back-up Officer, after he heard her request an "ETA" for her back-up. I asked Officer Saavedra what was he thinking when he heard Officer Smith ask for an ETA for her back-up and he responded: "At that time – knowing her, having worked with her – if she's advising that, that means that something's going down and she's got the sense that something might be going on with this driver".

Officer Saavedra stated that once he arrived on scene, other back-up Officers (Pacheco & McWilliams) were already there. He further advised that he stood on the passenger's side of Mr. Alexander's vehicle, since other Officers were already engaged with him. Officer Saavedra never made contact with Mr. Alexander, nor did he ever speak directly with him. I asked Officer Saavedra if he ever witnesses Officer Smith be discourteous with Mr. Alexander, to which he replied: "I did not". I also asked him if he ever observed the other two back-up Officers be discourteous with Mr. Alexander, to which he replied: "I did not". I inquired how long the entire traffic stop took to conduct, to which Officer Saavedra estimated: "I'd say maybe between ten, twelve minutes". (See Officer Saavedra's transcripts for further details).

On September 23, 2021, I issued Officer McWilliams a 5-day Notice to make an appointment to provide me a statement regarding this incident. On this same date, Officer McWilliams responded to my office, where I took a sworn taped statement from her. Prior to going on tape, I issued Officer McWilliams her Garrity Rights and Non-Criminal Rights, to which she acknowledged and signed. Officer McWilliams advised that she responded to Officer Smith's traffic stop as a back-up Officer after hearing Officer Smith requested an "estimated time of arrival for her back-up officer". Officer McWilliams indicated that she felt it was necessary to responded to this call as well, even though she was not Officer Smith's assigned back-up Officer. I asked Officer McWilliams if it was normal for an Officer to request an ETA for their back-up and she advised: "Usually we'll wait for the assigned back-up to respond. When you hear an Officer ask for the estimated time of arrival of the backup Officer, it's a little – you're concerned". "The first thing that came to mind to me is that her safety could potentially be in jeopardy".

I asked Officer McWilliams to describe what happened once she arrived on scene, and she stated: "So immediately when I approached the vehicle, the driver appeared hostile and asked for my

badge number. There was a little of a language barrier but he asked for my badge number and I asked, 'For what?' because I was baffled on why his demeanor was in a hostile manner, and why he wanted my badge number when I had just arrived on scene".

Officer McWilliams went on to advise that Mr. Alexander was recording the entire traffic stop from the time she arrived on scene utilizing his cell phone. Before Officer McWilliams could say anything to Mr. Alexander, he asked for her name and badge number. She indicated that she wanted to keep her distance because of his hostile demeanor and she simply pointed to her name tag on her outer patrol vest. She stated that before she had the chance to answer what her badge number was, Mr. Alexander began speaking with Officer Pacheco again. Officer McWilliams advised that she stayed quiet after this so not to agitate Mr. Alexander any further.

I asked Officer McWilliams how was she sure that Mr. Alexander could read her name tag when she pointed at it and she advised: "Because he recited it back to me and said R. McWilliams".

I asked Officer McWilliams if she thought that Mr. Alexander gave her an opportunity to tell him her badge number, and she stated: "I didn't feel like he did. And at that time, I felt it was in my best interest to just disengage because we had two other Officers present. He seemed agitated just by my presence because, like I said before, I didn't even speak to him yet". "I just walked up and already he was irate". So, because there were two other Officers on-scene, as a back-up Officer, I decided to disengage and not say anything else to further agitate him".

I advised Officer McWilliams that Mr. Alexander alleged that he was "classed" or "profiled" by Officer Smith. I asked her if there was any indication or did Officer Smith say anything that would lead her to believe that the only reason Officer Smith pulled over Mr. Alexander was because of his race or class, to which she advised: "No, sir".

I concluded the interview with Officer McWilliams by asking her how long did the entire traffic stop last, and she stated: "Maybe – estimate about 15 minutes". (See Officer McWilliams transcripts for further details).

On October 8, 2021, I issued Officer Smith a 5-day Notice to make an appointment to provide me a statement regarding this incident.

On October 21, 2021, I obtained a sworn taped statement from Officer Smith regarding this incident. Prior to going on tape, I issued Officer Smith her Garrity Rights and Non-Criminal Rights, to which she acknowledged and signed. Before we went on tape, I had Officer Smith take me to the location of the No U-turn sign. Officer Smith, Crime Scene Technician Ann Carrasco, and I all traveled there in my unmarked police vehicle (Vehicle # 744). Once Officer Smith identified the No U-turn sign, I instructed Crime Scene Technician Carrasco to photograph it and the surrounding area for this case.

Officer Smith advised that on the incident date and time, she observed Mr. Alexander make an illegal U-turn and she initiated a traffic stop in reference to the same. I asked Officer Smith upon making contact with Mr. Alexander, how was his demeanor, to which she stated: "He was already very agitated and disgruntled". Officer Smith stated that she advised him of the reason for the stop, and when Mr. Alexander requested her name and badge number, she provided it to him. I

asked Officer Smith what was Mr. Alexander's reaction when she informed him of the reason for the traffic stop and she stated: "He immediately called me a liar". Officer Smith further stated that upon asking Mr. Alexander for his driver's license, registration, and automobile insurance, he initially refused to provide it. She explained that he kept stalling and then began to record their interactions on his cell phone prior to providing any of the requested documents. Officer Smith advised me that she asked Mr. Alexander if he had any weapons or drugs in the vehicle. I asked her why she asked him this, and she stated: "Because, he started reaching around and reaching for things in the vehicle". At this point, Mr. Alexander still had not provided the requested documents for Officer Smith.

I asked Officer Smith if she remembered asking over the police radio if her back-up unit had an estimated time of arrival and why she did this. She stated to me: "Yes, because I was beginning to feel uncomfortable because he was being very irate and continuing to reach, and at that time I still didn't know who he was".

During our interview, I showed Officer Smith a copy of her Uniform Traffic Citation (#AEQGGKE) to which she confirmed was the one she wrote on the incident date and issued to Mr. Alexander. In the NOTES section of the citation, Officer Smith wrote: "Vehicle occupied one black male. Irate and uncooperative driver".

I asked Officer Smith if she conducted the traffic stop on Mr. Alexander because of his race, the color of his skin, his sex, or his overall appearance, all to which she replied: "No". (See Officer Smith's transcripts for further details).



Anthony Rosa Chief of Police

10440 W Oakland Park Blvd Sunrise, Florida 33351 (954) 764-4357



# Internal Affairs Complaint Report Narrative

## III. INVESTIGATIVE FINDINGS and DISPOSITION:

If Mr. Alexander's allegations are true, Officers Smith and McWilliams would have violated the following Sunrise Policies and Procedures:

<u>**56.4.5.**</u> – Bias Based Profiling – Taking action during traffic law enforcement activity based solely on a person's race, ethnicity, gender, religion, economic status, age, sexual orientation, or physical handicap.

<u>**56.6.1.1.5.**</u> – Officers are prohibited from conducting law enforcement or taking traffic law enforcement action based upon bias-based profiling.

<u>15.6.4.1.</u> – Officers will, as necessary and professionally appropriate, use techniques and strategies designed to prevent the perception of Biased Policing. These techniques include, but are not limited to:

<u>**15.6.4.1.4.**</u> – Provide your name and IBM number verbally or in writing, when requested.

Based on a preponderance of evidence standard, I conclude that Officers Smith and McWilliams did not violate any of the listed policies. The following is a list of factors that led me to this decision:

Officer Smith conducted a traffic on Mr. Alexander for making an illegal U-turn at the 8100 block of Sunset Strip. Officer Smith escorted this investigator to the actual no U-turn sign that she observed Mr. Alexander violate on the incident date and time. Officer Smith issued Mr. Alexander a Uniform Traffic Citation (#AEQGGKE) for "U-turn / Improper / Unsafe / Prohibited", which is a violation of F.S.S. 316.1515. Mr. Alexander was not detained longer than the period of time to investigate the traffic infraction. In fact, the entire length of time from start to finish of the traffic stop approximately 15 minutes.

Officer McWilliams responded to this traffic stop as a back-up Officer, out of concern for Officer Smith, when she requested an ETA for her back-up Officer via the police radio. Immediately upon making contact with Mr. Alexander, in fact before she could even say anything, Mr. Alexander was demanding her name and badge number. Due to Mr. Alexander still being inside of his vehicle, which it had not yet been determined if any weapons were within, his aggressive

demeanor, and obvious Officer Safety concerns, Officer McWilliams chose to keep her distance and point to her clearly displayed name tag, instead of approaching and further agitating Mr. Alexander. It is apparent that Mr. Alexander knew her name, since he is observed on BWC reciting it back to her: "R. McWilliams", as he is clearly recording her with his cell phone for his own future recollection or use. Mr. Alexander then demands Officer McWilliams badge number, and before she can even respond, he immediately turns his attention back to Officer Pacheco, states: "She's not going to give it to me" and continues a previous conversation with Officer Pacheco. Again, Officer McWilliams chose to stay quiet and not interrupt or engage Mr. Alexander in order keep the situation calm.

### **IV: CONCLUSION:**

Officer Smith had probable cause to conduct a traffic stop on Mr. Alexander for making an illegal U-turn. The traffic stop was not based on Mr. Alexander's race, sex, color of his skin, class, or overall appearance. Mr. Alexander was issued the appropriate traffic citation. Mr. Alexander was not detained any longer than what was reasonably necessary to issue this traffic citation. A review of all of the BWC related to this incident did not show any support for Mr. Alexander's claim that he was profiled. Officer McWilliams identified herself in a tactical position, keeping distance between herself and Mr. Alexander and pointing to her official police name tag. Mr. Alexander confirmed that he understood what her name was by reciting it back to her, once she points to her name tag on her outer patrol vest. Mr. Alexander does not give Officer McWilliams the opportunity to respond to his demand for her badge number, before re-engaging Officer Pacheco in conversation. Officer McWilliams made the logical and professional decision to stay quiet so as to not agitate Mr. Alexander any further.

This investigation will be classified as:

EXONERATED

| 1/2/21 |
Lt. P. Brian Katz, Internal Affairs	Date
Sean Vishers, Deputy Chief	Date
Anthony W. Rosa, Chief of Police	Date
Date	Date
Date	